# Project team on PPP Standard Transport Infrastructure – Urban Rail Transit

## Team meeting draft discussion and action items

**Friday, 21 Jul 2017 [Conference call] session (14:00-15:30 CEST)**

### Participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Team</th>
<th>Kaimeng Li, Chengbin Xu, Hongye Fan, Heather Deckard, Chris Lock, Cristobal Pollman Loosli, Fernando Lago, Naresh Bana</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Invited</td>
<td>Kaiyue Yang, Di Wu, Yuhang Ren, Hong Ma, Ling Zhu, Yingying Wang, Ning Wei, Zhaomiao Sun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apologies</td>
<td>Jonathan Beckitt, Doris Chevalier, Pekka Leviakangas, Mila Sullivan, Robert Wilson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNECE Secretariat</td>
<td>Claudio Meza</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Agenda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agenda item</th>
<th>Discussion</th>
<th>Action/Decision</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
<th>Deadline</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Roll-call</td>
<td>The UNECE Secretariat and the team leader welcomed the participants, and the UNECE Secretariat noted the apologies for absence.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Approve notes of previous session</td>
<td>Not discussed.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Discussion of Agenda items</td>
<td>Agenda item 1 Continually discuss the 9 SDGs mentioned at the team meeting dated 23 June 2017, and finalize the SGDs which should be concerned in the preparation of the urban rail transit PPP standard</td>
<td>1. Select only 5–6 SDGs as the main goals the project should mainly contribute to. And stress the contribution to environmental sustainability, green economy, poverty reduction and service accessibility. 2. Keep the number of pages of PPP Standard no more than 20 pages. Use attachments to complement the main body. 3. Ensure the potential replication and generalizability of the PPP Standard. 4. The UNECE Secretariat will send the team leader a written material of the selection criteria. Since the SDGs which should be focused on were changing, the questions may change simultaneously and could only be identified until the SDGs were decided.</td>
<td>The project team</td>
<td>Aug 18 or 25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<p>|       |           | Agenda item 2 Continually discuss on the 34 central questions mentioned at the team meeting and finalize the central questions which should be concerned in the preparation of the urban rail transit PPP standard | | Aug 18 or 25 |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agenda item</th>
<th>Discussion</th>
<th>Action/Decision</th>
<th>Responsibility</th>
<th>Deadline</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Agenda item 3</strong> Discuss the outline of the proposed urban rail transit PPP standard (The outline of the standard is enclosed with this minutes.)</td>
<td>1. The case studies should not only research on the positive and successful cases but also the negative and failed cases. The technical factors and environmental factors should also be reflected. 2. The UNECE Secretariat suggest the team members give feedback within 10 days. 3. The project team decide the SDGs to focus and the outline based on the feedback.</td>
<td>The project team</td>
<td>Aug 4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Agenda item 4</strong> Case studies: how the Urban Rail Transit PPP projects can contribute to the specified SDGs.</td>
<td>1. Chengbin Xu from China International Engineering Consulting Corporation (CIECC) shared a case study of the urban rail (Line 1) PPP project of Hohhot in Inner Mongolia in China and analyzed its compliance with and contributions to the SDGs. 2. The team members or the experts are expected to share 1-2 case studies next meeting.</td>
<td>The project team</td>
<td>Aug 18 or 25</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Items for decision</td>
<td>Decide which SDGs and questions should be focused.</td>
<td>The project team</td>
<td>Aug 18 or 25</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Other business</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Planning next meeting/call</td>
<td>The team leader suggested holding the next meeting on Aug 18 or 25 at 14:00 CEST. But the exact time was not decided yet.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Outline of Urban Rail Transit PPP Standard

I Introduction

II Objectives of the Standard

III Scope of the Standard

  3.1 Standard type: the project-centric standard of urban rail PPPs
  3.2 Sector focuses of the standard
  3.3 Geographic coverage of cases in the standard

IV Central Question

  Rationale of urban rail PPP in achieving the selected SDGs

A Project Types and Examples of Urban Rail PPPs

  A1 Criteria of project sample selection
  A2 Project types
  A3 Country-based urban rail PPP experience
    A3.1 Project examples in developed countries
    A3.2 Project examples in developing countries
    A3.3 Project examples in under-developed countries
  A4 List of projects

B Pros and cons of PPPs in the Urban Rail Sector

  B1 Core elements of successful urban rail PPPs
  B2 Lessons learnt from failed urban rail PPPs
  B3 Pros and cons of each PPP model
  B4 Advice on PPP model selection upon project type

C PPPs Meeting People First Objectives

  C1 Demonstrate the Replicability Scalability Equity Efficiency Sustainability
  C2 A urban rail PPP model to best achieve SDGs of UN

V Delivering the Model

  A Project Selection and Baseline Requirements for Private Interest
    A1 Identify objectives to adopt PPP model in urban rail projects
    A2 Appraisal financial and legal readiness of the project
    A3 Rationalize the project preparation and implementation procedure
      A3.1 Ensure a transparent and competitive bidding process
      A3.2 Consultation with all types of stakeholders
    A4 Allocate risks between public and private parties
    A5 Evaluate the project performance

  B Financing for Urban Rail PPPs
    B1 Fiscal affordability evaluation
    B2 Value for money evaluation
    B3 Identify financing demand and sources
    B4 Design project financing structure
      B4.1 Full life-cycle cost and revenue analysis
B4.2 An asset-based financing concept
B5 Mitigation measures of financing risks

C Legal Requirements for Urban Rail PPPs
   C1 Establish a legislative framework at national level
   C2 Establish a regulatory framework at sector level
   C3 Identify legal terms and rules at project level
   C4 Ensure an effective system of legal enforcement
   C5 Promote Zero Tolerance to Corruption

D Feasibility for Low And Middle Income Countries
   D1 Main Challenges and opportunities of low and middle income countries in urban rail
       PPPs
   D2 Successful and failed project cases
   D3 Advice on how to achieve SDGs through recommended urban rail PPP model in low
       and middle income countries

E Other Issues Related To Urban Rail PPPs
   E1 Contract management
   E2 Project asset management

VI Indicators of Compliance
VII Credits and References
Annex 1 Case Studies
Annex 2 List of projects of urban rail PPPs
Annex 3 Sector-specific knowledge, terms and terminology