# Evaluation Methodology

**Table of contents**


- Scope
- Project leader & editor
- Project information
- Meetings
- Relevant documents
- References
  - Case studies
- Contacts and members
- How to participate


## Scope

**Application scope**

The Evaluation Methodology (officially "People-first PPP Evaluation Methodology for the Sustainable Development Goals") should be readily usable by governments, private sector, private lenders, and international organizations, and applicable to all PPP sectors and all categories of PPP projects, whether they are small-scaled or large-scaled, national or cross-border. It can be applied to publicly-owned projects, PPP projects - both government-pay PPPs and concessions (user-pay) - or any other partnership frameworks (e.g. institutional PPPs).

**Project activities and sequences**

The design of this tool will result from a multi-stakeholder consultation process and a robust collaborative endeavor therefore ensuring effective implementation and wide-scale adoption. The development process should be conducted in a constant back-and-forth process compliant with the following sequences before the tool goes back to the Bureau for its consideration and approval:

1. A project lead at the UNECE secretariat will be appointed to manage and oversee the entire project process.
2. A technical group composed of experts will be set up to develop the tool.
3. A multi-stakeholder validation group will review the tool regularly and make recommendations for its improvement. In addition to the business community, PPP Units, international organizations, other UN bodies, academia and NGOs/CSOs, the UNECE secretariat will also approach banks and key International Finance Institutions (African-Development Bank, Asian Development Bank, World-Bank, etc.) to make sure that they are part of this group and are fully involved in the validation process.
4. The technical group will revise it accordingly and deliver a second version after final validation is conducted.
5. The tool will be tested against actual projects. Good practices and lessons learned will be documented, and issues will be identified.
6. The technical group will make the necessary improvements to fine-tune the tool and will integrate the recommendations of the validation group following the same process as described above.
7. Once the revised draft is approved by the validation group, it will be published on the UNECE website for public review.
8. The validation group will make key recommendations for the effective implementation of the tool, taking into account challenges at global, country and project level.

## Project leader & editor

| Position | Name |
|---|---|
| Project co-leaders | Melissa PENEYCAD<br>Joan Enric RICART<br>James STEWART |
| Editor | |

## Project information

| Stage status | ODP Stage | ODP Name | Stage start date | Stage end date | Meetings / Minutes | Relevant documents |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| ✓ | 1 | Project initiation | 1st quarter 2019 | 1st quarter 2019 | | Project proposal |
| ✓ | 2 | Stakeholder mobilization | 1st quarter 2019 | 2nd quarter 2019 | Meetings & minutes | |
| ✓ | 3 | Developing initial draft | 3rd quarter 2019 | June 2020 | Meetings & minutes | |

| | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| ✓ | 4 | Public review | June, 2020 | August, 2020 | Meetings & minutes | **Draft for Public Review**<br>• **Version 1.0 (June, 2020)**: MS Word / PDF<br>• **Comments log**<br>  ○ Comments (August 2020) |
| ✓ | 5 | Endorsement | 2020 | 2020 | | Version for endorsement by the Working Party (December, 2020) - E |
| ✓ | 6 | Approval | 2021 | 2021 | | • Version (November 2021) - E / F / R<br>• Self-Assessment Tool - E |
| | 7 | Maintenance | | | | |

## Meetings

**>>**

List of meetings

## Relevant documents

**>>**

| | File | Locked By | Modified |
|---|---|---|---|
| | PDF File People-first PPP Impact Assessment Tool-Project Proposal.pdf Project Proposal | | 08 Aug, 2019 by Claudio MEZA |
| | PDF File 190325-Preparatory Meeting Agenda.pdf Agenda Preparatory Meeting 25 March 2019 | | 23 Apr, 2020 by Claudio MEZA |
| | PDF File Preparatory Meeting Concept Note.pdf Preparatory meeting-Concept Note | | 23 Apr, 2020 by Claudio MEZA |
| | Microsoft Word Document UNECE PPP People-first PPP Impact Assessment Tool-Comments T.docx Public Review - Comments template | | 12 Jun, 2020 by Claudio MEZA |
| | Microsoft Word Document UNECE PPP People-first PPP Impact Assessment Tool-Public Review v1.0.docx Draft Impact Assessment Tool v1.0 | | 12 Jun, 2020 by Claudio MEZA |
| | PDF File UNECE PPP People-first PPP Impact Assessment Tool-Public Review v1.0.pdf Draft Impact Assessment Tool v1.0 (pdf) | | 12 Jun, 2020 by Claudio MEZA |
| | Microsoft Word Document UNECE PPP People-first PPP Impact Assessment Tool-Public Review Comments Log.docx Comments Log on draft Impact Assessment Tool v1.0 | | 26 Aug, 2020 by Claudio MEZA |
| | PDF File UNECE PPP People-first PPP Impact Assessment Tool-Public Review Comments Log.pdf Comments Log on draft Impact Assessment Tool v1.0 | | 26 Aug, 2020 by Claudio MEZA |

Download All

## References

>>

## Case studies

- Case studies Compendium 2016 - (8th session Team of Specialists on PPP. October 2016, Geneva)
- Case studies Compendium 2017 - (2nd International Forum on PPPs. May 2017, Hong Kong)
- Case studies Compendium 2018 - (3rd International Forum on PPPs. May 2018, Geneva)
- Case studies Compendium 2019 - (3rd session Working Party on PPP. December 2019, Geneva)
- Case studies Compendium 2020 - Contributions to the development of the Impact Assessment Tool project

# Contacts and members

| Position | Name |
|---|---|
| Project leader | Melissa PENEYCAD<br>Joan Enric RICART<br>James STEWART |
| Editor | |

**Team Members - Impact Assessment Tool**



Melissa PENEYCAD

(Canada)

**Project team leader**

Managing Director & Director Sustainable Projects, Institute for Sustainable Infrastructure (ISI). She has 20 years' professional experience, most of which have focused on developing, implementing, and administering sustainability and resiliency standards, frameworks, and rating systems for infrastructure, commercial real estate, and industrial products. Since joining ISI in 2016, Melissa has verified the sustainability and resiliency of more than 70 infrastructure projects across the US, Canada, and overseas, collectively worth more than US$25 billion with another US$25 billion in infrastructure development under her purview. Prior to ISI, Melissa was an associate of sustainable development at Stantec, a global engineering, consulting and design services firm and was the national sustainability program manager for BOMA Canada, a prominent commercial real estate association. Melissa has a Bachelor of Commerce degree, a Master of Environmental Studies degree and a Graduate Diploma in Business and Sustainability.

More details.



Joan Enric RICART

(Spain)

**Project team leader**

Carl Schrøder Professor of Strategic Management, IESE Business School. He has been Chairman of the Strategic Management Department at the IESE Business School for 23 years. He is a Fellow of the SMS and EURAM and he was the Founding president of the European Academy of Management (EURAM) and President of the Strategic Management Society (SMS). He has published several books and articles in leading journals as Strategic Management Journal, Harvard Business Review, Journal of International Business Studies, Econometrica or Quarterly Journal of Economics. His current research focused on business models and Cities. He is co-academic director of IESE Cities in Motion and academic director of the Specialist Centre of Excellence on PPPs in Smart and Sustainable Cities.



James STEWART

(United Kingdom)

**Project team leader**

Joined KPMG in May 2011 as chairman of KPMG's Global Infrastructure practice. In his role he has visited over 40 countries to discuss their infrastructure investment programmes. Prior to joining KPMG, James was Chief Executive of Infrastructure UK and before that Chief Executive of Partnerships UK. In these roles James has been at the centre of the UK Government's thinking on PFI and PPPs and has had a significant involvement in many of the major projects and programmes in the infrastructure market; eg Crossrail, LIFT, Building Schools for the Future. James was responsible for the publication of the UK's first National Infrastructure Plan. He is a Fellow of the Institute of Civil Engineers and a member of the World Economic Forum Infrastructure Global Agenda Council.

**Sub-group: Access and equity**

**Doris CHEVALIER**

(France)

(Sub-group leader)



Civil engineer from the Ecole des Ponts et Chaussées de France and a recognized expert from his peers in project financing and in particular PPP. After having worked for more than 25 years for large private groups (Vinci, Bouygues, Alstom), public entities (Autoroute du sud de France, Ministère des Finances - Unit PPP) and in investment funds, mainly in main funding roles for infrastructure, she created her company INFRABOOST in 2015 to serve as structural finance consultancy in project finance. She has participated in more than 20 billion euros in projects worldwide and has been in charge of implementing State Guarantee projects for infrastructure in response to the 2008 financial crisis. She is a pioneer in Impact Finance.

Doris Chevalier has supported the work of the PPP UNECE team since 2014 and is also an expert for the European Commission (INEA & H2020 PME program), member of the DRBF (Dispute Board Resolution Foundation) and administrator of Paris International Airport.

| Name | Organization | Country |
|---|---|---|
| Mr. Manuel CARY | TIIC Investment Advisor (SICIT S.A.) | Portugal |
| Mr. Christopher CLEMENT-DAVIES | Independent PPP expert and legal/policy adviser | United Kingdom |
| Mr. Luiz Eduardo JUNQUEIRA | Private Consultant | Brazil |
| Mr. David MATÉ SANZ | INECO | Spain |
| Mr. Arvind MAYARAM | CUTS Institute for Regulation & Competition | India |
| Ms. Ntoetse MOFOKA | Central Bank of Lesotho – Project Management Office | Lesotho |
| Mr. Thibaut MOURGUES | Independent Infrastructure Impact Investing Partners (4IP LLC) | France |
| Mrs. Sophie PAQUOT | Impact Management Practitioner | United Kingdom |
| Mr. Fernando PEÑALBA MARTÍNEZ | Ministerio de Fomento, Spain | Spain |
| Ms. Oshani PERERA | International Institute for Sustainable Development | Switzerland |
| Mr. João Simão PIRES | Portuguese Water Partnership (PWP) | Portugal |
| Ms. Narantsetseg PUREV | Private Consultant | Mongolia |
| Mr. Yehuda RAVEH | Independent PPP Expert | Israel |
| Mr. Jordi SALVADOR | IESE Business School - Barcelona, Spain | Spain |
| Mr. Art SMITH | National Council for Public-Private Partnerships | United States of America |
| Mr. Andrea STUCCHI | World Bank Consultant | Italy |
| Mr. Radha Krishna TRIPATHY | Independent PPP Expert | India |
| Mr. Laurin Baptiste WUENNENBERG | International Institute for Sustainable Development (IISD) | Switzerland |
| Mr. Syed ZAIDI | Senior Director. Partnership Development / Public Private Partnerships Office. Alberta Infrastructure, Government of Alberta, Canada | Canada |
| Ms. Irina ZAPATRINA | PPP Center Ukraine | Ukraine |

**Sub-group: Environmental sustainability and resilience**

**Anand CHIPLUNKAR**

(India)

(Sub-group leader)



Dr. Anand Chiplunkar has a unique expertise of more than four decades working in Central and West Asia, South and Southeast Asian countries as well as in the USA. He has expertise in Integrated Urban Development, Water Supply and Sanitation, Environmental Management and Infrastructure Development through a Public Private Partnership (PPP) approach.

He retired in 2016 after working for a decade in the Asian Development Bank, Manila as Director, Urban Development and Water Division in the Central and West Asia Department. Earlier he worked in IL&FS Infrastructure Development Corporation, New Delhi as Senior Vice President. Since 2016, he provides strategic advisory services to different organizations including the UN Economic Commission for Europe in People's First Public Private Partnerships.

His experience covers country sector policy development in the context of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs); strategic planning, project development and implementation of municipal projects; development of innovative approaches; knowledge management including publications. He has guided initiatives in the Asian Development Bank (ADB) that focused on Inclusive, Competitive and Green Cities development with climate change and resilience perspectives for projects in water, wastewater and solid waste management, urban transport and other urban sub-sectors. He is an expert in Water Supply and Sanitation having worked on projects aided by multi-lateral agencies. He has also led teams in developing PPP projects in partnership with government agencies in urban, transport, industrial area development and tourism sectors. Earlier, he also has conducted numerous Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) studies for infrastructure sectors and industries.

More details.

| Name | Organization | Country |
|---|---|---|
| Ms. Hajar BENNAR | Strategy Consultant at the Moroccan Agency for Energy Efficiency (AMEE), Moroccan Ministry of Energy, Mines, and Sustainable Development | Morocco |
| Mr. Pascual BERRONE | IESE Business School - Barcelona, Spain | Spain |
| Mr. Pierre-Alix BINET | Finance for Tomorrow | France |
| Mr. Martin BRUZA | Independent PPP expert | Czech Republic |
| Mr. Laurent CRÉMOUX | C5P | France |
| Ms. Sanaz JAVADI FARAHZADI | Lawyer | Iran |
| Ms. Lira KASYMBEKOVA | Head of External Relationships and Investment Division, Ministry of Agriculture of the Kyrgyz Republic. | Kyrgyzstan |
| Mr. George KATAPODIS | Hellenic Public Procurement Authority | Greece |
| Mr. Arnaud KPONDJO | University Abomey Calavi | Benin |
| Ms. Aikaterini KYRIAZI | Hellenic Public Procurement Authority | Greece |
| Mr. Alan LAU | AngloEuro Developers | Singapore |
| Mr. Alfredo LUCENTE | Lucente International Lawyers | Italy |
| Mr. Djamel MEDJAHED | Health-Bio-Pharm, Switzerland | Switzerland |
| Mr. Bulat YESSEKIN | Regional coordinator of the Central Asia network of experts on sustainable development | Kazakhstan |

**Sub-group: Economic effectiveness, including fiscal sustainability**

**Jean-Patrick MARQUET**

(France)

(Sub-group leader)



A French national based in Geneva, Switzerland, is a senior executive in development finance, currently a member of the World Economic Forum's Global Future Council on Infrastructure, an executive think-tank seeking to chart a path for sustainable infrastructure investment. He is also acting as a subgroup leader on behalf of the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe to design an evaluation methodology for infrastructure projects, measuring their contribution to the UN Sustainable Development Goals 2030. Until 2018, Jean-Patrick was a Managing Director at the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development (EBRD), running successively the Turkey offices (2015-2017, €7 billion portfolio, 90 staff) and the Infrastructure business group (2017-2018, €12 billion portfolio, 110 staff). His earlier career at EBRD and Credit Agricole CIB in London and Paris focused on project finance in infrastructure, oil & gas, energy, mining and property. Jean-Patrick holds a Master in Management from HEC Paris and a Master of Law from the Assas law school at Paris-II University.

More details.

| Name | Organization | Country |
|---|---|---|
| Ms. Eunice AJAMBO | United Nations Economic Commission for Africa | |
| Mr. Athanasios BOURTSALAS | Columbia University, NY | United States of America |
| Mr. Ray BROWN | Independent PPP expert | United Kingdom |
| Dr. Alena DADZERKINA | Ministry of Transport and Communication, Belarus | Belarus |
| Mr. Fuad HUSEYNOV | Islamic Development Bank (ISDB) | Uzbekistan |
| Mr. Mukhitdin ISHANKHODJAEV | SkyPower Services Central Asia | Uzbekistan |
| Mr. Christian KINGOMBE | 4IP Group LLC | Denmark |
| Ms. Anna KOWALEWSKA | PWC | Poland |
| Mr. Michel LEONARD | University of Geneva | Switzerland |
| Mr. Francesco MICCI | Certified Public Accountant & Statutory Auditor - Financial Advisor - PPP Expert | Italy |
| Mr. Gavin MUNRO | Société Générale Corporate and Investment Bank | Hong Kong, China |
| Ms. Yu NAMBA | Toyo University | Japan |
| Mr. Rafael PÉREZ FEITO | FCC AQUALIA | Spain |
| Mr. Vincent PIRON | Independent PPP Expert | France |
| Ms. Fatoumata SANYANG | Directorate of Public-Private Partnership, Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, Gambia | Gambia |
| Mr. Sharafjon SHERALIEV | Consultative Council on Improvement of Investment Climate under the President of Tajikistan | Tajikistan |
| Ms. Sanja SOVRAN | Infinity Global Consulting LLC | United States of America |
| Mr. Stefan STARTZEL | Independent PPP Expert | United Kingdom |
| Mr. Dietrich STILLER | Schilling, Zutt & Anschütz (Corporate Law Firm) | Germany |
| Mr. Mehmet UZUNKAYA | Presidency of Turkish Republic, Strategy and Budget Office | Turkey |
| Mr. Steffen WARMBOLD | hochschule 21 gem. GmbH, state accredited private Hochschule | Germany |
| Mr. Erik WEHL | Seaport Group | Denmark |
| Mr. Lars D. WELLEJUS | University of Frankfurt | Germany |
| Ms. Yanzhen WENG | Deputy Director Ph.D. Research Associate, China Academy of Transportation Sciences | China |
| Mrs. Sedef YAVUZ NOYAN | Presidency of Turkish Republic, Strategy and Budget Office | Turkey |
| Mr. Ahmad Matin ZAHID | PPP Unit on Health, Afghanistan | Afghanistan |

**Sub-group: Replicability**

**Tetiana BESSARAB**

(Ukraine)

(Sub-group leader)



- 17 years of professional legal practice in Ukraine, CIS and CEE; admitted to Ukrainian Bar since 2007 (attorney at law at Kyiv Bar Association)
- Cross border consultant and international lawyer in the region of CIS, Central and Eastern Europe
- Member of the ICC Ukraine Committee on PPPs; Member of UNECE PPP Business Advisory Board, expert at UNECE Working Party on Public-Private Partnerships
- Areas of expertise include project financing, PPP, real estate and construction, banking and finance, project finance, infrastructure and development, cross-border investments

| Name | Organization | Country |
|---|---|---|
| Ms. Gavkhar ASHIROVA | Bishkek City Development Agency, Mayor's office, Investment & Public-private partnership (PPP) department | Kyrgyzstan |
| Mr. Jan G. JANSSENS | JJC Advisory Services sàrl | Switzerland |
| Ms. Svetlana MASLOVA | University of Saint Petersburg | Russian Federation |
| Mr. Dragutin NENEZIC | WB6 PPPs & Concessions | Serbia |
| Mr. Olaniyi OLANIYAN | Federal Capital Territory Administration – Satellite Towns Development Department (STDD), Nigeria | Nigeria |
| Ms. Natalia OVSYANKO | Academy of public administration under the aegis of the President of the Republic of Belarus | Belarus |
| Mr. Manuel PROTÁSIO | Vieira de Almeida e Associados | Portugal |
| Mr. Peter ROWAN | Raisecrown (Maldives based Think Tank and Investment Conglomerate) | France |
| Ms. Malike SAGYNDYKOVA | PPP Unit Kazakhstan | Kazakhstan |
| Mr. Pierre SARRAT | Sustainable Infrastructure Foundation | Switzerland |
| Mr. Ivan VUYTSIK | EIT Climate-KIC, Climate Launchpad | Russian Federation |
| Mr. Agha WAQAR JAVED | Former Head of PPP Cell, Government of Punjab, Pakistan | Pakistan |

**Sub-group: Stakeholder engagement**

**Amanda LOEFFEN**

(United Kingdom)

(Sub-group leader)



Chief Executive of 'Human Right 2 Water', with a goal to provide sustainable solutions based on human rights to improve water governance worldwide. She is an experienced general manager and business development executive in water, energy and sustainable development, with international experience in Australasia, Europe and North America. She acts as subgroup leader on behalf of the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe to design an evaluation methodology for infrastructure projects, measuring their contribution to the UN Sustainable Development Goals 2030. Director General of WaterLex until 2019, she led a team of water governance experts to encourage law and policy reform. Previously, leading a project management company in New Zealand, Amanda delivered environmental resource consent for a large community water infrastructure scheme for irrigation and hydro-generation. This involved an extensive community and multi-stakeholder engagement programme to adapt the project to meet all stakeholder demands for environmental, social, cultural, and economic impacts.

| Name | Organization | Country |
|---|---|---|
| Mr. Fred AMONYA | Lyciar | United Kingdom |
| Mr. Pandala ANILKUMAR | Enterprise Computing Solutions P.LTD. | India |
| Ms. Eleni BAKOULA | Hellenic Single Public Procurement Authority–HSPPA/Law Firm | Greece |
| Ms. Nadia BALGOBIN | IDEAS Centre SPP Advisor | Switzerland |
| Mr. Sergio FERNÁNDEZ DE CÓRDOVA | P3 Smart City Partners, Inc | Spain |
| Mr. Muhammad Sarfraz KHAN | PPPP Comset International | Pakistan |
| Mr. Azlan MORAD | CrissCross International (CrissX) boutique airport/aviation consultancy | Germany |
| Mr. Cristobal POLLMAN | Independent PPP Expert | Chile |
| Mr. Míquel RODRÍGUEZ | Commissioner of the 2030 Agenda, Barcelona City Council | Spain |
| Mr. Raymond SANER | Centre for Socio-Eco-Nomic Development (CSEND) | Switzerland |
| Mr. Prashant SHARMA | World Bank | India |
| Ms. Irina TSAY | SOS Children's Villages International | Republic of Korea |
| Dr. Steven VAN GARSSE | University Hasselt & AMS | Belgium |
| Mr. Scott WALCHAK | Private Consultant | United States of America |
| Ms. Lichia YIU | Centre for Socio-Eco-Nomic Development (CSEND) | Switzerland |

## How to participate

⚠ *To participate please contact* WP-PPP Secretariat