# **Evaluation Methodology**

#### **Table of contents**

- Scope
- Project leader & editor
- Project information
- Meetings
- Relevant documents
- References
  - Case studies
- · Contacts and members
- How to participate

# Scope

#### **Application scope**

The Evaluation Methodology (officially "People-first PPP Evaluation Methodology for the Sustainable Development Goals") should be readily usable by governments, private sector, private lenders, and international organizations, and applicable to all PPP sectors and all categories of PPP projects, whether they are small-scaled or large-scaled, national or cross-border. It can be applied to publicly-owned projects, PPP projects - both government-pay PPPs and concessions (user-pay) - or any other partnership frameworks (e.g. institutional PPPs).

#### Project activities and sequences

The design of this tool will result from a multi-stakeholder consultation process and a robust collaborative endeavor therefore ensuring effective implementation and wide-scale adoption. The development process should be conducted in a constant back-and-forth process compliant with the following sequences before the tool goes back to the Bureau for its consideration and approval:

- 1. A project lead at the UNECE secretariat will be appointed to manage and oversee the entire project process.
- 2. A technical group composed of experts will be set up to develop the tool.
- 3. A multi-stakeholder validation group will review the tool regularly and make recommendations for its improvement. In addition to the business community, PPP Units, international organizations, other UN bodies, academia and NGOs/CSOs, the UNECE secretariat will also approach banks and key International Finance Institutions (African-Development Bank, Asian Development Bank, World-Bank, etc.) to make sure that they are part of this group and are fully involved in the validation process.
- 4. The technical group will revise it accordingly and deliver a second version after final validation is conducted.
- 5. The tool will be tested against actual projects. Good practices and lessons learned will be documented, and issues will be identified.
- The technical group will make the necessary improvements to fine-tune the tool and will integrate the recommendations of the validation group following the same process as described above.
- 7. Once the revised draft is approved by the validation group, it will be published on the UNECE website for public review.
- 8. The validation group will make key recommendations for the effective implementation of the tool, taking into account challenges at global, country and project level.

## Project leader & editor

Position	Name
Project co-leaders	Melissa PENEYCAD
	Joan Enric RICART
	James STEWART
Editor	

# **Project information**

Stage status	ODP Stage	ODP Name	Stage start date	Stage end date	Meetings / Minutes	Relevant documents
•	1	Project initiation	1 <sup>st</sup> quarter 2019	1 <sup>st</sup> quarter 2019		Project proposal
•	2	Stakeholder mobilization	1 <sup>st</sup> quarter 2019	2 <sup>nd</sup> quarter 2019	Meetings & minutes	
•	3	Developing initial draft	3 <sup>rd</sup> quarter 2019	June 2020	Meetings & minutes	

•	4	Public review	June, 2020	August, 2020	Meetings & minutes	Version 1.0 (June, 2020): MS Word / PDF     Comments log     Comments (August 2020)
•	5	Endorsement	2020	2020		Version for endorsement by the Working Party (December, 2020) - E
•	6	Approval	2021	2021		<ul> <li>Version (November 2021) - E / F / R</li> <li>Self-Assessment Tool - E</li> </ul>
	7	Maintenance				

# Meetings

>> List of meetings

# Relevant documents

File	Locked By	Modified
PDF File People-first PPP Impact Assessment Tool-Project Proposal.pdf Project Proposal		08 Aug, 201 Claudio ME
PDF File 190325-Preparatory Meeting Agenda.pdf Agenda Preparatory Meeting 25 March 2019		23 Apr, 202 Claudio ME
PDF File Preparatory Meeting Concept Note.pdf Preparatory meeting-Concept Note		23 Apr, 202 Claudio ME
Microsoft Word Document UNECE PPP People-first PPP Impact Assessment Tool-Comments T.docx Public Review - Comments template		12 Jun, 202 Claudio ME
Microsoft Word Document UNECE PPP People-first PPP Impact Assessment Tool-Public Review v1.0.docx Draft Impact Assessment Tool v1.0		12 Jun, 202 Claudio ME
PDF File UNECE PPP People-first PPP Impact Assessment Tool-Public Review v1.0.pdf Draft Impact Assessment Tool v1.0 (pdf)		12 Jun, 202 Claudio ME
Microsoft Word Document UNECE PPP People-first PPP Impact Assessment Tool-Public Review Comments Log.docx Comments Log on draft Impact Assessment Tool v1.0		26 Aug, 202 Claudio ME
PDF File UNECE PPP People-first PPP Impact Assessment Tool-Public Review Comments Log.pdf Comments Log on draft Impact Assessment Tool v1.0		26 Aug, 202 Claudio ME

# References

#### **Case studies**

- Case studies Compendium 2016 (8<sup>th</sup> session Team of Specialists on PPP. October 2016, Geneva)
- Case studies Compendium 2017 (2<sup>nd</sup> International Forum on PPPs. May 2017, Hong Kong)
- Case studies Compendium 2018 (3<sup>rd</sup> International Forum on PPPs. May 2018, Geneva)
- Case studies Compendium 2019 (3<sup>rd</sup> session Working Party on PPP. December 2019, Geneva)
- Case studies Compendium 2020 Contributions to the development of the Impact Assessment Tool project

### Contacts and members

Position	Name
Project leader	Melissa PENEYCAD
	Joan Enric RICART
	James STEWART
Editor	

#### **Team Members - Impact Assessment Tool**



#### Melissa PENEYCAD

(Canada)

#### Project team leader

Managing Director & Director Sustainable Projects, Institute for Sustainable Infrastructure (ISI). She has 20 years' professional experience, most of which have focused on developing, implementing, and administering sustainability and resiliency standards, frameworks, and rating systems for infrastructure, commercial real estate, and industrial products. Since joining ISI in 2016, Melissa has verified the sustainability and resiliency of more than 70 infrastructure projects across the US, Canada, and overseas, collectively worth more than US\$25 billion with another US\$25 billion in infrastructure development under her purview. Prior to ISI, Melissa was an associate of sustainable development at Stantec, a global engineering, consulting and design services firm and was the national sustainability program manager for BOMA Canada, a prominent commercial real estate association. Melissa has a Bachelor of Commerce degree, a Master of Environmental Studies degree and a Graduate Diploma in Business and Sustainability.

More details.



#### Joan Enric RICART

(Spain)

#### Project team leader

Carl Schrøder Professor of Strategic Management, IESE Business School. He has been Chairman of the Strategic Management Department at the IESE Business School for 23 years. He is a Fellow of the SMS and EURAM and he was the Founding president of the European Academy of Management (EURAM) and President of the Strategic Management Society (SMS). He has published several books and articles in leading journals as Strategic Management Journal, Harvard Business Review, Journal of International Business Studies, Econometrica or Quarterly Journal of Economics. His current research focused on business models and Cities. He is co-academic director of IESE Cities in Motion and academic director of the Specialist Centre of Excellence on PPPs in Smart and Sustainable Cities.



#### James STEWART

(United Kingdom)

#### Project team leader

Joined KPMG in May 2011 as chairman of KPMG's Global Infrastructure practice. In his role he has visited over 40 countries to discuss their infrastructure investment programmes. Prior to joining KPMG, James was Chief Executive of Infrastructure UK and before that Chief Executive of Partnerships UK. In these roles James has been at the centre of the UK Government's thinking on PFI and PPPs and has had a significant involvement in many of the major projects and programmes in the infrastructure market; eg Crossrail, LIFT, Building Schools for the Future. James was responsible for the publication of the UK's first National Infrastructure Plan. He is a Fellow of the Institute of Civil Engineers and a member of the World Economic Forum Infrastructure Global Agenda Council.

## Sub-group: Access and equity

**Doris CHEVALIER** 

(France)

(Sub-group leader)



Civil engineer from the Ecole des Ponts et Chaussées de France and a recognized expert from his peers in project financing and in particular PPP. After having worked for more than 25 years for large private groups (Vinci, Bouygues, Alstom), public entities (Autoroute du sud de France, Ministère des Finances - Unit PPP) and in investment funds, mainly in main funding roles for infrastructure, she created her company INFRABOOST in 2015 to serve as structural finance consultancy in project finance. She has participated in more than 20 billion euros in projects worldwide and has been in charge of implementing State Guarantee projects for infrastructure in response to the 2008 financial crisis. She is a pioneer in Impact Finance.

Doris Chevalier has supported the work of the PPP UNECE team since 2014 and is also an expert for the European Commission (INEA & H2020 PME program), member of the DRBF (Dispute Board Resolution Foundation) and administrator of Paris International Airport.

Name	Organization	Country
Mr. Manuel CARY	TIIC Investment Advisor (SICIT S.A.)	Portugal
Mr. Christopher CLEMENT- DAVIES	Independent PPP expert and legal/policy adviser	United Kingdom
Mr. Luiz Eduardo JUNQUEIRA	Private Consultant	Brazil
Mr. David MATÉ SANZ	INECO	Spain
Mr. Arvind MAYARAM	CUTS Institute for Regulation & Competition	India
Ms. Ntoetse MOFOKA	Central Bank of Lesotho – Project Management Office	Lesotho
Mr. Thibaut MOURGUES	Independent Infrastructure Impact Investing Partners (4IP LLC)	France
Mrs. Sophie PAQUOT	Impact Management Practitioner	United Kingdom
Mr. Fernando PEÑALBA MARTÍNEZ	Ministerio de Fomento, Spain	Spain
Ms. Oshani PERERA	International Institute for Sustainable Development	Switzerland
Mr. João Simão PIRES	Portuguese Water Partnership (PWP)	Portugal
Ms. Narantsetseg PUREV	Private Consultant	Mongolia
Mr. Yehuda RAVEH	Independent PPP Expert	Israel
Mr. Jordi SALVADOR	IESE Business School - Barcelona, Spain	Spain
Mr. Art SMITH	National Council for Public-Private Partnerships	United States of America
Mr. Andrea STUCCHI	World Bank Consultant	Italy
Mr. Radha Krishna TRIPATHY	Independent PPP Expert	India
Mr. Laurin Baptiste WUENNENBERG	International Institute for Sustainable Development (IISD)	Switzerland
Mr. Syed ZAIDI	Senior Director. Partnership Development / Public Private Partnerships Office. Alberta Infrastructure, Government of Alberta, Canada	Canada
Ms. Irina ZAPATRINA	PPP Center Ukraine	Ukraine

Sub-group: Environmental sustainability and resilience





Dr. Anand Chiplunkar has a unique expertise of more than four decades working in Central and West Asia, South and Southeast Asian countries as well as in the USA. He has expertise in Integrated Urban Development, Water Supply and Sanitation, Environmental Management and Infrastructure Development through a Public Private Partnership (PPP) approach.

He retired in 2016 after working for a decade in the Asian Development Bank, Manila as Director, Urban Development and Water Division in the Central and West Asia Department. Earlier he worked in IL&FS Infrastructure Development Corporation, New Delhi as Senior Vice President. Since 2016, he provides strategic advisory services to different organizations including the UN Economic Commission for Europe in People's First Public Private Partnerships.

His experience covers country sector policy development in the context of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs); strategic planning, project development and implementation of municipal projects; development of innovative approaches; knowledge management including publications. He has guided initiatives in the Asian Development Bank (ADB) that focused on Inclusive, Competitive and Green Cities development with climate change and resilience perspectives for projects in water, wastewater and solid waste management, urban transport and other urban subsectors. He is an expert in Water Supply and Sanitation having worked on projects aided by multi-lateral agencies. He has also led teams in developing PPP projects in partnership with government agencies in urban, transport, industrial area development and tourism sectors. Earlier, he also has conducted numerous Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) studies for infrastructure sectors and industries.

More details.

Name	Organization	Country
Ms. Hajar BENNAR	Strategy Consultant at the Moroccan Agency for Energy Efficiency (AMEE), Moroccan Ministry of Energy, Mines, and Sustainable Development	Morocco
Mr. Pascual BERRONE	IESE Business School - Barcelona, Spain	Spain
Mr. Pierre-Alix BINET	Finance for Tomorrow	France
Mr. Martin BRUZA	Independent PPP expert	Czech Republic
Mr. Laurent CRÉMOUX	C5P	France
Ms. Sanaz JAVADI FARAHZADI	Lawyer	Iran
Ms. Lira KASYMBEKOVA	Head of External Relationships and Investment Division, Ministry of Agriculture of the Kyrgyz Republic.	Kyrgyzsta
Mr. George KATAPODIS	Hellenic Public Procurement Authority	Greece
Mr. Arnaud KPONDJO	University Abomey Calavi	Benin
Ms. Aikaterini KYRIAZI	Hellenic Public Procurement Authority	Greece
Mr. Alan LAU	AngloEuro Developers	Singapore
Mr. Alfredo LUCENTE	Lucente International Lawyers	Italy
Mr. Djamel MEDJAHED	Health-Bio-Pharm, Switzerland	Switzerlar
Mr. Bulat YESSEKIN	Regional coordinator of the Central Asia network of experts on sustainable development	Kazakhsta

Sub-group: Economic effectiveness, including fiscal sustainability

Jean-Patrick MARQUET
(France)

(Sub-group leader)



A French national based in Geneva, Switzerland, is a senior executive in development finance, currently a member of the World Economic Forum's Global Future Council on Infrastructure, an executive think-tank seeking to chart a path for sustainable infrastructure investment. He is also acting as a subgroup leader on behalf of the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe to design an evaluation methodology for infrastructure projects, measuring their contribution to the UN Sustainable Development Goals 2030. Until 2018, Jean-Patrick was a Managing Director at the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development (EBRD), running successively the Turkey offices (2015-2017, €7 billion portfolio, 90 staff) and the Infrastructure business group (2017-2018, €12 billion portfolio, 110 staff). His earlier career at EBRD and Credit Agricole CIB in London and Paris focused on project finance in infrastructure, oil & gas, energy, mining and property. Jean-Patrick holds a Master in Management from HEC Paris and a Master of Law from the Assas law school at Paris-II University.

More details.

Name	Organization	Country
Ms. Eunice AJAMBO	United Nations Economic Commission for Africa	
Mr. Athanasios BOURTSALAS	Columbia University, NY	United States of America
Mr. Ray BROWN	Independent PPP expert	United Kingdom
Dr. Alena DADZERKINA	Ministry of Transport and Communication, Belarus	Belarus
Mr. Fuad HUSEYNOV	Islamic Development Bank (ISDB)	Uzbekistan
Mr. Mukhitdin ISHANKHODJAEV	SkyPower Services Central Asia	Uzbekistan
Mr. Christian KINGOMBE	4IP Group LLC	Denmark
Ms. Anna KOWALEWSKA	PWC	Poland
Mr. Michel LEONARD	University of Geneva	Switzerland
Mr. Francesco MICCI	Certified Public Accountant & Statutory Auditor - Financial Advisor - PPP Expert	Italy
Mr. Gavin MUNRO	Société Générale Corporate and Investment Bank	Hong Kong, China
Ms. Yu NAMBA	Toyo University	Japan
Mr. Rafael PÉREZ FEITO	FCC AQUALIA	Spain
Mr. Vincent PIRON	Independent PPP Expert	France
Ms. Fatoumata SANYANG	Directorate of Public-Private Partnership, Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, Gambia	Gambia
Mr. Sharafjon SHERALIEV	Consultative Council on Improvement of Investment Climate under the President of Tajikistan	Tajikistan
Ms. Sanja SOVRAN	Infinity Global Consulting LLC	United States of America
Mr. Stefan STARTZEL	Independent PPP Expert	United Kingdom
Mr. Dietrich STILLER	Schilling, Zutt & Anschütz (Corporate Law Firm)	Germany
Mr. Mehmet UZUNKAYA	Presidency of Turkish Republic, Strategy and Budget Office	Turkey
Mr. Steffen WARMBOLD	hochschule 21 gem. GmbH, state accredited private Hochschule	Germany
Mr. Erik WEHL	Seaport Group	Denmark
Mr. Lars D. WELLEJUS	University of Frankfurt	Germany
Ms. Yanzhen WENG	Deputy Director Ph.D. Research Associate, China Academy of Transportation Sciences	China
Mrs. Sedef YAVUZ NOYAN	Presidency of Turkish Republic, Strategy and Budget Office	Turkey
Mr. Ahmad Matin ZAHID	PPP Unit on Health, Afghanistan	Afghanistan

Sub-group: Replicability

**Tetiana BESSARAB** 

(Ukraine)

(Sub-group leader)



- 17 years of professional legal practice in Ukraine, CIS and CEE; admitted to Ukrainian Bar since 2007 (attorney at law at Kyiv Bar Association)
- Cross border consultant and international lawyer in the region of CIS, Central and
- Cross border consultant and international lawyer in the region of CIS, Central and Eastern Europe
   Member of the ICC Ukraine Committee on PPPs; Member of UNECE PPP Business Advisory Board, expert at UNECE Working Party on Public-Private Partnerships
   Areas of expertise include project financing, PPP, real estate and construction, banking and finance, project finance, infrastructure and development, cross-border investments

Name	Organization	Country
Ms. Gavkhar ASHIROVA	Bishkek City Development Agency, Mayor's office, Investment & Public-private partnership (PPP) department	Kyrgyzstan
Mr. Jan G. JANSSENS	JJC Advisory Services sàrl	Switzerland
Ms. Svetlana MASLOVA	University of Saint Petersburg	Russian Federation
Mr. Dragutin NENEZIC	WB6 PPPs & Concessions	Serbia
Mr. Olaniyi OLANIYAN	Federal Capital Territory Administration – Satellite Towns Development Department (STDD), Nigeria	Nigeria
Ms. Natalia OVSYANKO	Academy of public administration under the aegis of the President of the Republic of Belarus	Belarus
Mr. Manuel PROTÁSIO	Vieira de Almeida e Associados	Portugal
Mr. Peter ROWAN	Raisecrown (Maldives based Think Tank and Investment Conglomerate)	France
Ms. Malike SAGYNDYKOVA	PPP Unit Kazakhstan	Kazakhstan
Mr. Pierre SARRAT	Sustainable Infrastructure Foundation	Switzerland
Mr. Ivan VUYTSIK	EIT Climate-KIC, Climate Launchpad	Russian Federation
Mr. Agha WAQAR JAVED	Former Head of PPP Cell, Government of Punjab, Pakistan	Pakistan

Sub-group: Stakeholder engagement

# Amanda LOEFFEN (United Kingdom) (Sub-group leader)



Chief Executive of 'Human Right 2 Water', with a goal to provide sustainable solutions based on human rights to improve water governance worldwide. She is an experienced general manager and business development executive in water, energy and sustainable development, with international experience in Australasia, Europe and North America. She acts as subgroup leader on behalf of the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe to design an evaluation methodology for infrastructure projects, measuring their contribution to the UN Sustainable Development Goals 2030. Director General of WaterLex until 2019, she led a team of water governance experts to encourage law and policy reform. Previously, leading a project management company in New Zealand, Amanda delivered environmental resource consent for a large community water infrastructure scheme for irrigation and hydro-generation. This involved an extensive community and multi-stakeholder engagement programme to adapt the project to meet all stakeholder demands for environmental, social, cultural, and economic impacts.

Name	Organization	Country
Mr. Fred AMONYA	Lyciar	United Kingdom
Mr. Pandala ANILKUMAR	Enterprise Computing Solutions P.LTD.	India
Ms. Eleni BAKOULA	Hellenic Single Public Procurement Authority-HSPPA/Law Firm	Greece
Ms. Nadia BALGOBIN	IDEAS Centre SPP Advisor	Switzerland
Mr. Sergio FERNÁNDEZ DE CÓRDOVA	P3 Smart City Partners, Inc	Spain
Mr. Muhammad Sarfraz KHAN	PPPP Comset International	Pakistan
Mr. Azlan MORAD	CrissCross International (CrissX) boutique airport/aviation consultancy	Germany
Mr. Cristobal POLLMAN	Independent PPP Expert	Chile
Mr. Míquel RODRÍGUEZ	Commissioner of the 2030 Agenda, Barcelona City Council	Spain
Mr. Raymond SANER	Centre for Socio-Eco-Nomic Development (CSEND)	Switzerland
Mr. Prashant SHARMA	World Bank	India
Ms. Irina TSAY	SOS Children's Villages International	Republic of Korea
Dr. Steven VAN GARSSE	University Hasselt & AMS	Belgium
Mr. Scott WALCHAK	Private Consultant	United States of America
Ms. Lichia YIU	Centre for Socio-Eco-Nomic Development (CSEND)	Switzerland

# How to participate

